



2014 Annual Evaluation Synthesis

of

The Performance of ITC Programmes and Functions

Evaluated in 2012 and 2013

Evaluation Unit, ITC

May 2014

Contents

I.	Background and methodology.....	3
II.	Alignment to corporate objectives	6
	Assessment	6
	Emerging issues.....	9
III.	Market situation of the Organization	10
	Strengths	10
	Weaknesses	11
	Opportunities.....	13
	Threats	13
IV.	Implementation of evaluation recommendations.....	14
V.	Issues and recommendations	16
	Annex: Analysis Framework of alignment to Corporate Objectives	19

Acronyms used in the text

EFAL:	Ethical Fashion Africa Ltd
EnACT:	Enhancing Arab Capacity for Trade Programme
ES:	Export Strategy Function
ITC-SF:	ITC's Strategic Framework (adopted by the UN General Assembly)
MDGs:	Millennium Development Goals
NTF II:	The Netherlands Trust Fund Programme II
OIF:	Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie
PCTP:	Poor Communities and Trade Programme
RBM:	Results-based Management
SMEs:	Small and Medium-sized Enterprises
SSCP :	South-South Cooperation Programme - « Expansion du commerce intra- et interrégional entre les Etats membres de la CEMAC, de l'UEMOA et des pays francophones du Mékong »
SWOT:	Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats
TSI:	Trade Support Institution
UNEG:	United Nations Evaluation Group
WEDF:	The World Export Development Forum

I. Background and methodology

1. **Background** - This is the second year that ITC issues an evaluation synthesis report to convey the key messages of evaluation to ITC stakeholders. In doing so, the ITC Evaluation Unit aligns the practice of annual evaluation synthesis report with the good practice standard promoted by the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG).
2. The present evaluation synthesis represents progress made compared with the synthesis of last year. The number of independent evaluations that follow a common methodology in line with the ITC Evaluation Policy is increasing, and their quality is gradually enhanced. The Evaluation Unit is now more enabled to conduct the annual evaluation synthesis to identify the performance related issues and trends in ITC performance across the board. As part of its learning and accountability purposes, the present synthesis includes a chapter analysing the findings and lessons extracted from the evaluations completed in 2012-2013 concerning the achievements towards fulfilling ITC corporate objectives.
3. As the samples of the programmes evaluated in the past two years are still too small to be representative of the population of ITC operations (projects, programmes, strategies, functions, processes, etc), the results presented should not be simply implied as the performance of the organization, rather that of certain functions of ITC. The bias inherent due to sampling size will be gradually reduced in the coming years as the evaluation data base expands to cover more areas and functions.
4. **Purpose** - The objectives of the 2014 Evaluation Synthesis of ITC Operations are to: (i) present a synthesis of the performance of ITC-supported operations based on reviewing the independent evaluations conducted in 2012 and 2013; and, (ii) highlight key learning issues and challenges that ITC needs to address to enhance the performance and results of the ITC trade-related technical assistance in developing countries.
5. **Scope** - The analyses contained in the report are strictly referred to related findings of the individual evaluations managed by the ITC Evaluation Unit. The Independent Evaluation of the ITC launched in 2013, has been carried out by an external evaluation team and has not been taken into account for the drafting of the present synthesis.

6. The analysis of the alignment to corporate objectives and the analysis of the implementation of the recommendations include six evaluations completed in 2012-2013 (see the list in table 1). The Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats (SWOT) analysis covers mainly the three evaluations completed in 2013, and it also integrates the key findings of the SWOT analysis of evaluations completed in 2012 (prepared in 2013)¹.

Table 1. List of Evaluations Completed in 2012-2013

Evaluations	Acronym	Completed
Export Strategy Function <i>Implementation period: 2003 - 2013</i>	ES	2013
Poor Communities and Trade Programme – midterm evaluation <i>Implementation period: 2011 - 2015</i>	PCTP	2013
The Netherlands Trust Fund Programme II <i>Implementation period: 2009-2013</i>	NTF II	2013
South-South Cooperation Programme – « OIF Expansion du commerce intra- et interrégional entre les Etats membres de la CEMAC, de l’UEMOA et des pays francophones du Mékong » - midterm evaluation <i>Implementation period: 2009-2013</i>	SSCP	2012
The World Export Development Forum <i>Implementation period: 2010 - 2011</i>	WEDF	2012
Enhancing Arab Capacity for Trade – midterm evaluation <i>Implementation period: 2010 - 2011</i>	EnACT	2012

7. To match the timeline of evaluations completed, the report applies the corporate objectives 2012-2013 endorsed by the UN General Assembly in assessing the alignment to corporate objectives. It should be acknowledged that there is a time discrepancy between the programme design and the release of the 2012-13 corporate objectives. That means the corporate objectives guiding programme design prior to 2012 may not be identical to the corporate objectives 2012-2013; however the strong coherence of the post-2007 ITC’s mission and objectives justifies the

¹ The evaluations conducted in 2012 and 2013 and the Analysis of the Evaluations conducted in 2012 are available at <http://www.intracen.org/itc/about/how-itc-works/evaluation/>

relevance of measuring against the 2012-2013 corporate objectives approved by UN General Assembly.

8. **Composition of the synthesis** - The evaluation synthesis is composed of three integral building blocks. The first building block is to assess the alignment of ITC programmes and functions to ITC's organization's objective and expected accomplishments as approved by the UN General Assembly². The analysis tries to address the question as to what extent the evaluated programmes/functions have contributed to achieving the corporate objectives, of which ITC is accountable. Within the capacity of the annual evaluation synthesis, this analysis would form a part of the accountability review of ITC.
9. The second building block presents a strategic situation analysis based on analysing the organisation's performance-related strengths and weaknesses in the context of facing external challenges and opportunities. This part of analysis emphasizes the needs of ITC to reinforce ITC's current market status through continually adapting ITC modus operandi to the development trends, and also stresses the need of integrating evaluation findings in future strategic planning.
10. The third building block provides a quantitative and qualitative account of the implementation status of evaluation recommendations that management agreed to implement. The issues emerged and difficulties encountered are presented.
11. The last chapter stresses the strategic issues to be considered in future programme design and implementation. Among the issues raised in evaluations, this synthesis presents selected key issues, which bear significance deserving corporate strategic consideration. Addressing these issues at corporate-level, holds high potential for improving the performance and results of ITC operations in countries and reinforcing ITC's partnership position in trade development. In this respect, this paper will also serve as thought provoker on selected issues critical to the success of the organization in achieving objectives and demonstrating results.

² United Nations, Strategic framework for the period 2012-2013, General Assembly
<http://itcnet.intracen.org/dbms/Docman2/Documents/TECH20868.pdf>

II. Alignment to corporate objectives

12. **Evaluation criteria applied** - The analysis of the alignment to corporate objectives applies three key evaluation criteria related to achieving corporate objectives: *relevance*, *effectiveness*, and *impact*. In the context of assessing alignment to strategic objectives, other standard criteria related to evaluations of development interventions, such as efficiency and sustainability, are less applicable in this case.³ An evaluation rating system is applied; the six-point evaluation rating scale indicates the level of performance against each evaluation criteria.⁴

Assessment

13. As this analysis is not to assess the validity of the results chain between the organizational objective and expected accomplishments, as given in the ITC's Strategic Framework (ITC-SF) adopted by the UN General Assembly, this paper follows the given structure and setting of the objectives, and assess the achievements of the programmes towards attaining these objectives accordingly.

14. As presented in the ITC-SF for the period 2012-2013, the objective of the Organization is *to foster sustainable economic development and contribute to achieving the Millennium Development Goals in the developing and transition economies through trade and international business development*. This organizational goal and three related expected accomplishments at corporate-level are referred as corporate objectives in this paper. In detail, the expected accomplishments as indicated in the ITC-SF are:

- i. *Strengthened integration of the business sector into the global economy through enhanced support to policymakers;*
- ii. *Increased capacity of trade support institutions to support businesses;*
- iii. *Strengthened international competitiveness of enterprises through ITC training and support.*

³ A detailed analysis of each programme and function in achieving corporate objectives is seen in the analysis framework in the Annex

⁴ Six point evaluation rating system:

Satisfactory Category: 6 Highly satisfactory, 5 Satisfactory, 4 Moderately satisfactory

Unsatisfactory Category: 3 Moderately unsatisfactory, 2 Unsatisfactory, 1 Highly unsatisfactory

15. **Toward achieving organizational objective** - The six evaluations completed in 2012-2013 expressed a clear message that ITC programmes are, by and large, on track in achieving the organizational objective. Based on evaluation findings, the ES, PCTP, NTF II, and SSCP were clearly directing the programme services to support trade-related economic development and, to varied extent, achieving other related Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), such as poverty reduction, gender equality, and global partnership. ITC services provided by these programmes, be supporting development of trade strategy, cross border trade, capacity of Trade Support Institutions (TSIs), or trade growth of enterprises, are largely in-line with ITC's mandate, strengths, experience, and resources, although a few evaluation findings challenged the appropriate composite of expertise provided in certain programmes. One exception is the moderately unsatisfactory relevance of WEDF, which did not have an articulated objective, and made no clear direction to either sustainable economic development or MDGs.

16. The implementation of the programmes was less effective in achieving the expected outcomes, as evidenced by modest implementation results of programmes across the board with exceptions of the good performance of NTF II and PCTP. Based on evaluation findings, the critical challenge for the organization is to demonstrate convincing development impact in terms of sustainable economic development, trade growth, poverty reduction, women's empowerment and social progress. The performance of the six programmes in achieving the corporate objective is rated as **moderately satisfactory**, a composite rating of satisfactory rating for relevance, moderately satisfactory rating for effectiveness, and unsatisfactory rating for impact.

Table 2. Ratings table on alignment to the organizational objective, each programme

Evaluation criteria	ES	PCTP	NTF II	EnACT	WEDF	SSCP	composite rating
Relevance	5	5	5	4	3	5	4.5
Effectiveness	4	5	5	4	2	3	3.8
Impact	1	4	4	2	1	2	2.3

17. Regarding the performance toward attaining the expected accomplishment I – *strengthened integration of the business sector into the global economy through enhance support to policy makers*, among the six programmes evaluated, only the ES Function made articulated and convincing alignment to this objective. The ES made concrete contribution to developing

national export strategies with strong participation of country partners, and also to a less extent, to implementing the strategies. The performance of the six programmes in this regard is considered as **moderately unsatisfactory**.

18. The evaluations revealed that ITC made great effort in achieving the expected accomplishment II - *increased capacity of trade support institutions to support businesses*. Four out of the six programmes made strong alignment to this objective. Among them, the NTF II made distinctive performance in terms of both design and implementation results. NTF II was designed to strengthen TSI networks in serving export of enterprises along selected value chains in five developing countries. The TSIs supported by NTF II were able to generate revenues to sustain their business, which is also conducive to continued capacity building and commitment of the TSIs. The performance of the programmes in this respect is rated as **moderately satisfactory**, reflecting a combined consideration of strong project design and weaker implementation results and sustainability.

19. The performance in achieving the expected accomplishment III - *strengthened international competitiveness of enterprises through ITC training and support* – is related to that of the expected accomplishment II, as the support to TSIs often are mixed with that to enterprises. Five programmes are aligned to this objective, although the implementation results varied significantly. Among the five, PCTP and NTF II made satisfactory performance. PCTP explored a model to support a social enterprise – Ethical Fashion Africa Ltd (EFAL) - in Kenya. PCTP supported EFAL in taking business orders from international fashion houses and the EFAL organized production by the local workers and entrepreneurs. The capacity of the social enterprise in supplying international fashion houses and organizing local production were significantly enhanced. The sustainability is uncertain, however, as it depends on whether the social enterprise could sustain business orders. NTF II enhanced the Small and Medium-sized Enterprise (SME) competitiveness and export transactions. It is reported that 52 per cent of Bangladeshi beneficiaries increased exports to Europe in 2012. The performance in this respect is rated as **moderately satisfactory**.

Emerging issues

20. **Overambitious programme objectives and weak implementation arrangements:** In aligning with corporate objectives, ITC programmes frequently set broad and far-reaching objectives, such as “sustainable, long-term impact on competitiveness and market access”, and “contribution to sustainable economic and social development”, which are often beyond the measure of the programmes to monitor and report. The scale of the ambition itself is not problematic; it is the mismatching between ambitious objectives and weak institutional arrangements for implementing, measuring and validating the results. This mismatch led to a tendency of overemphasizing the expected results (often claimed as impact) in design, but under-emphasizing how to achieve and measure them in implementation with given resources, short time-span, modest coordination with policy makers, and absence of country presence.
21. **Insufficient integration of Millennium Development Goals:** ITC aims to contribute to achieving MDGs including the prominent goal of poverty reduction. The pursuit of trade development is not always coherent with the purpose of poverty reduction, as trade does not always benefit the poor. As revealed by evaluations, ITC programmes, such as PCTP, are piloting approaches in reducing poverty through trade development. So far, ITC has not developed a policy on addressing poverty reduction, which leaves poverty consideration at the discretion of each programme. Similarly, gender equality and women’s empowerment has gradually become an integral part of ITC operations, as witnessed in evaluations. The instruments deployed to enhance women’s empowerment in trade development, however, are not always explicit or sufficient, as certain programmes missed this theme.
22. **Weakness in monitoring and evaluation:** This issue is repetitive across the evaluated projects. Evaluations often could collect data on numbers of workshop or training organized by the project, or numbers of meetings and participants, but there is rare information on results at outcome or impact level, such as results of trade growth of enterprises, or economic and social progress of target groups in the field.

III. Market situation of the Organization

Strengths

23. ITC has established a record of designing relevant interventions, as evidenced by the three programmes evaluated in 2013 (see table 1). This positive record is not only registered in terms of strategic focus (relevance), but also concerning the effectiveness and quality of service delivery and the innovative and adaptive features. In the overall, the **high relevance** of these programmes was a noted feature of ITC programme design. The evidence described below is putting ITC in a recommended position to meet the challenges of organizational growth and replication and scaling up of activities:

- a. The ES evaluation validated the relevance of ITC's approach and methodology to meet the demand for support of policymakers in the field of trade-related strategy, in their efforts to strengthen the integration of their business sector into international value chains as an increasing condition for sustainable development;
- b. The NTF II evaluation confirmed the effectiveness in increasing the capacity of TSIs to support their businesses community. The 'learning by doing' approach was deemed as pertinent for improving exporter competitiveness, as was seen by the selected TSIs' capacity to deliver value chain-related services to SMEs.
- c. The PCTP was assessed as an innovative intervention to strengthen the international competitiveness of enterprises. Its success factor has been to identify the market requirements of international fashion houses as the pivot point of the intervention. Supply issues (upgrading skills of beneficiaries and implementing high quality standards and disciplines) have been treated with the clear objective of selling products. This has enabled (mainly female) workers in poor communities to earn higher income through their own work with observed levels of increased self-esteem.

24. Part of the success factors for ITC interventions, even more-so than in 2012, is related to an **effective RBM** combining oversight and decentralisation in management arrangement, which was flexible to circumstances while retaining a structure of accountability. As the PCTP and NTF II evaluations mentioned, ITC was successful in linking decentralized management along with senior managers' oversight and strategic guidance often through Steering Committees. This enabled

simple and flexible management approaches and effective and timely communication, where local managers had decision-making authority and senior management could provide for quick responses to address emerging issues, thereby facilitating participation among stakeholders, decision-making, and helping to gain buy-in from beneficiaries, partners and donors.

25. In-line with evaluation findings, ITC demonstrated its capacity to effectively deliver **high quality of technical services**, and to transfer skills, knowledge and expertise to its implementing counterparts and end beneficiaries. ITC's focus and mode of delivery (learning by doing, and train the trainer), is seen as a useful approach to fostering knowledge transfer.

26. Similar to 2012 findings, 2013 evaluations confirm that ITC continues to be positioned and recognized as an honest broker and a natural convener in the field of enhancing sustainable economic development through trade and private sector development.

Weaknesses

27. The review of 2012 evaluations showed the difficulties that ITC was facing in managing a full project cycle, in terms of weak planning, lack of a clear vision and strategic focus as well as inconsistent management of delivery. In 2013, these weaknesses remained though varied across the three programmes. The evaluations found limited internal and external coordination in multi-year, multi-initiative programmes in terms of design, execution planning, exit strategy, client relationship, follow-up, and monitoring and reporting.

28. In particular, a weakness that was identified in 2012 evaluations but also strongly evidenced by those in 2013, is the lack of an appropriate **exit strategy to ensure sustainability** and scaling up:

- a. The ES evaluation assessed the export strategy methodology as highly relevant and very competitive in the market, particularly in terms of its effort of building capacity. However, it found limited evidence that the export strategies have actually been implemented in the countries and have generated more exports.
- b. There is evidence that PCTP has successfully started to deal with structural aspects of poverty, linking informal sector producers (mainly women) of disadvantaged communities to international fashion houses, increasing the income of these households. This scheme, though innovative, has so far only been supporting a limited number of workers, and

moreover, poverty effects are still limited and will need to be substantiated and sustained in time.

- c. The NTF II programme has effectively established a model to enhance export competitiveness for SMEs in selected sectors. The intervention rationale is to promote export along a selected value chain, and focus support on TSIs which are willing to invest with their own resources. Its ultimate effect on SMEs still remains to be assessed; however the good practices developed by the model should be recognized.

29. Perhaps, due to the innovative nature, the programmes went into implementation without having defined all the approaches and criteria for operations. However, a programme's results and impact can only be convincing in the context of an **explicit theory of change** that defines a clear causality and sequence between programme's activities and the expected results. Evaluation findings indicate that the process of establishing clear theories of change, together with refining business models and establishing explicit accountabilities, has proved difficult:

- a. In the case of the ES evaluation, unclear accountability within the ITC on results of Export Strategy in beneficiary countries made it difficult to assess the impact of the interventions.
- b. In the NTF II, the conceptual development and implementation of the operational criteria during the inception period proved time-consuming, and led to a reduction of time for implementation and to lower overall disbursement of funds for implementation.
- c. Similarly in the PCTP, the programme downsized its activities in order to better organize the business infrastructure and create systems to manage it, operating a drastic diminution of the number of its beneficiaries.

30. Finally the evaluations in 2013 confirmed uneven ITC-wide performance in securing internal coordination, knowledge sharing and collaboration and indicate the need to develop **internal protocols of interventions** to align knowledge management, results reporting, budgeting and decision-making with streamlined use of shared resources (ex. R&D, needs analysis) across sections. Management systems show deficiencies in that they do not foster corporate-wide economy of scale (administration/operational costs were often high), which must be addressed before expansion or scaling up.

Opportunities

31. The evaluations conducted in 2013 identify an important growth potential based on the opportunity to **extended implementation cycle** to generate results on the ground:

- a. In view of the growing demand for export strategies and the influence they have in guiding follow-up investments, there is an existing opportunity to extend services from strategy design to strategy implementation. The evaluation recommends developing post-design support to facilitate beneficiary countries with access to solutions and resources from suppliers, including ITC's.
- b. Since ITC has no country presence, the NTF II intervention through multiplier effect of TSIs to support SMEs was effective. There is an opportunity to replicate and scale up this model in other value chain-focused interventions with attention on the sustainability of TSIs.
- c. The PCTP programme developed an innovative approach to address poverty alleviation through trade development. This approach is worth being continued and refined. There is a critical need for inclusive interventions which take into consideration of the development needs of marginalized and vulnerable social groups, such as the poor, women and youth. Within ITC, it is worth making it this approach replicable.

32. In recent years, ITC is moving toward managing bigger projects and programmes and, in doing so, has developed new models of interventions and enhanced capacity to deliver. Building on this experience and capacity, there is an opportunity to support **innovative services** for the purposes of improving operational efficiency, building flagship services, and customizing ITC services to the emerging needs and challenges faced by developing countries. This will be necessary if operational efficiencies are to be realized. The participatory approach and a decentralized approach to management, where accountability is integral to operations, could facilitate this.

Threats

33. The most significant threat is that partners, including donors and clients, may not perceive ITC is strong in creating concrete results in developing and transition economies, as ITC is failing to demonstrate development **impact at the field level**, and RBM and results chain were not always well integrated in ITC programmes and projects. The 2013 evaluations confirmed a series of

interlinked threats related to the need to credibly demonstrate impact. So long as ITC programmes remain ambiguous about how to directly contribute to achieving corporate objectives, it will inhibit ITC's full potential.

34. ITC needs to adapt to the new developments in the **Aid for Trade market** marked by increasingly demanding and action- and impact-oriented, with increasing trends towards unbundling financing and delivery of technical assistance and widespread use of open-bidding processes. This implies maintaining an effective communication with, and good understanding of, ITC clients. Concurrently, it is necessary to manage clients' expectations, since all evaluations highlighted the reality that concrete results take time, especially if they are to be sustainable. Weak capacity and 'aid fatigue' of ITC clients, could thwart programme efforts and erode confidence in ITC.
35. The growing demand of client countries on relevant and effective interventions also necessitates ITC to enhance design quality, implementation and replication of services, and develop and retain a critical mass of expertise – and from both inside and outside the ITC, coupled with sound financial arrangement for the intervention. How to address this challenge on ITC's human resources and organisational capacity will have long-term impact both on the organization's market position and on the trade development results in countries.

IV. Implementation of evaluation recommendations

36. The present analysis is to present the implementation status of the evaluation recommendations and the emerging issues. The analysis is based on the data provided by individual programmes through two follow-up rounds in June and December 2013⁵. The programmes evaluated are required to report periodically on the implementation status of evaluation recommendations, and of the activities of the work plan agreed for implementation. The Evaluation Unit relies on the data provided by the programme management to conduct this analysis.
37. All the programmes evaluated in 2012 -2013 are succeeded with a new project or programme: (i) a new EnACT project was launched in Morocco in 2013 with a focus on women and youth employment; (ii) a new WEDF event will take place in Rwanda in 2014; (ii) the PCTP programme is

⁵ The Management Responses to the NTF II and ES evaluations were not finalized in December 2013 and these evaluations are therefore not included in the analysis developed in this Chapter.

extended to 2020; and (iv) a successor programme of SSCP funded by OIF is scheduled to start in early 2015. It is noteworthy that the design of these new interventions was developed on the basis of the learning generated by the evaluations and the experience of implementing these recommendations. This progress is a sign of further progress in the use of evaluation as an integral and constructive function of the organizational learning and performance improvement loop.

Table 3. Status of recommendation implementation (as of 31 December 2013)

Evaluations (date of issuance)	Total recommendations	Implementation Status				
		Not started	Ongoing	Final Status		
				Not implemented	Partially implemented	Implemented
Enact (2012)	9					9
WEDF (2012)	9	1	6			2
SSCP (2012)	12		6		1	5
PCTP (2013)	21	1	17			3
Total	51	2	29	0	1	19

38.**EnACT**. All recommendations were implemented by the end of the programme and considered in the design of the new project. A notable progress is that, in line with the recommendation on harmonization of trade related policies and strategies, EnACT successfully linked the Halal certification authorities in Malaysia (JAKIM and Standards Malaysia) with Standards bodies in Egypt (Egyptian Organisation for Standardisation), which led to a Memorandum of Understanding between the two countries focussing on mutual recognition of Halal standards. Following programme initiatives, staff from Egyptian institutions (EOS and Food Export Council) benefitted from training programmes offered by Standards Malaysia, building stronger relations between both the countries and continuing the collaboration beyond the programme.

39.**WEDF**. It is expected that the recommendations, in particular those focused on clearer audience analysis and enhancing the value of WEDF for partners, will be put into practice in the

preparation and implementation of the WEDF event that will take place in Rwanda in 2014. It is noted that the objectives of the WEDF function have been defined, but still not yet articulated, and the draft agenda remains to be endorsed. This is primarily due to the change in management of the ITC during the course of 2013, during which time the WEDF did not take place.

40. **PCTP.** In line with the evaluation recommendation on poverty reduction focus, the project design further clarifies and strengthens the orientation towards poverty alleviation. The programme is in the process of increasing the number of beneficiaries, while increasing sales at the national and regional markets. In addition, lessons learned from the programme are being capitalized to obtain better economy of scale. There are also efforts ongoing in relation to fashion houses increasing their involvement in and contribution to the programme.
41. **SSCP.** The actions leading towards the implementation of six recommendations are currently undertaken by programme during the bridging period to a successor programme on SSCP which would start in 2015. During the implementation of evaluation recommendations, a model of an evaluation form for trade missions was developed and adopted by the participating countries, with a view to assess the impact of the economic and trade missions beyond the life time of the project. In addition, OIF and ITC have made the necessary technical and financial support in the preparation of assignments and consulting services to businesses.

V. Issues and recommendations

42. The issues and recommendations presented in this chapter intend to synthesize the key issues analysed in the alignment to corporate objectives, ITC's market position, and implementation status of evaluation recommendations. The analysis provides recommendations to support the ITC to address four major challenges regarding: (i) enhancing monitoring and evaluation systems and demonstrating convincing development results; (ii) sustaining the organization's relevance to the highly demanding needs of client and partners; (iii) supporting ITC's corporate accountability; and, (iv) improving ITC's contribution to sustainable economic development and the achievement of the MDGs.
43. The **weak project evaluability and monitoring** and insufficient data on implementation progress and results are evidenced by each and every evaluation. This constitutes the main obstacle for ITC to demonstrate results and impact in a systematic and reliable manner. Anecdotal reporting is

not sufficient to demonstrate that ITC is reliable in presenting convincing results both at corporate and country levels. The claim of results has to be provided with: (i) convincing results chain (causality), (ii) related analysis, such as poverty analysis of target groups or enterprise competitiveness situation analysis, and (iii) evidence-based verifiable data over the project period. To demonstrate reliable development results, ITC has to address this long-lasting weakness in monitoring, evaluation and reporting system, and set a roadmap on it.

44. The 2013 evaluations show an evolution towards an improvement in ITC's RBM culture. However, in the overall, the evaluations conducted during the 2012-2013 biennium indicate that data collected through project monitoring is still mainly focusing on recording activities and outputs and makes limited information available on results at outcome or impact level. In the future, enhanced **integration of RBM and results chain in ITC programmes** will require: (i) designing clear theories of change to define causality and sequencing of series of activities into results; (ii) managing programmes by aligning implementation arrangements with expected results, in particular through coordination with implementing partners; and, (iii) allowing adequate resources and time for the achievement and measurement of results

45. As found in the past evaluations, **limited sustainability prospect** of ITC interventions hinders the demonstration of ITC's results. The evaluation findings emphasized time and again that ITC needs to extend the service cycle to include an exit strategy with national and local partners for the benefit of enhancing the sustainability and scaling up of its interventions.

46. In the same vein, it is imperative to recognize the importance of implementation arrangements in the field, and allocate proportionate resources to **build strong partnership** with country counterparts to ensure proper monitoring, result tracking, and follow-up measures in place. Therefore, ITC needs to enhance the capacity and process in selecting qualified and motivated implementing partners and in fostering local partnerships for delivering programme services.

47. There is also a need to **enhance policy guidance**. Although ITC is reiterating the operational focus on many relevant areas, such as the Gender Policy to guide the integration of gender development in programme design, there is a lack of clear corporate policy and guideline on how to design interventions in areas such as trade development, partnership and resource mobilizing, enterprise development, youth and employment, poverty reduction, sustainable development, middle income countries, least-development countries, etc.

48. Towards achieving ITC's corporate objective, ITC needs to **consolidate experience in poverty reduction, and articulate a corporate policy** in this respect guiding programme design in addressing poverty in client countries and targeted sectors. A relevant approach to contribute to lift significant numbers of people out of poverty would be to focus on poor people with the resources and capacity to improve their enterprises and trade and on areas with great density of poor people and greatest potential for trade and business development. There should also be a delicate consideration on whether ITC's targeting strategy should be inclusive to the poorest and most vulnerable groups, to what extent, and in which ways.

49. **Gender equality and women's empowerment** in trade and development interventions. ITC has released a Gender Policy in 2011 and the emphasis on gender development is growing in ITC programmes since then. However, previous evaluations were not able to emphasize the gender consideration in evaluating programme design and results, and there was often a lack of gender disaggregated data on development outcome and results. From 2014, ITC evaluations would systematically assess the gender equality performance of ITC programmes and functions in new evaluations, in line with the Gender Policy.

50. ITC is at the stage to consider stepping up efforts in **promoting greater visibility** with partners and stakeholders, which would help mobilize political support and co-financing especially from the critical ITC stakeholders. To this end, ITC should consolidate and promote ITC intervention models both internally and among partners. The evaluations found that ITC programmes are constantly piloting innovations, which is a strength in a changing environment, but also indicates that ITC needs to emphasize replication and scaling-up of successful intervention models and approaches among key partners by partners working in TRTA in developing countries.

Annex: Analysis Framework of alignment to Corporate Objectives

Corporate objective of the ITC: <i>(in line with the ITC's Strategic Framework adopted by the UN General Assembly, 2012-2013)</i>	Alignment Ratings
To foster sustainable economic development and contribute to achieving the Millennium Development Goals in the developing and transition economies through trade and international business development	
ES: Based on the evaluation findings, the ES is aligned to the objective of the organization. The principal objective of ES is to strengthen the capacity of partner countries in formulating and managing the implementation of export strategies, which is a critical factor contributing to the sustainable economic development and other MDGs. The four-staged approach of developing a country, sector or regional export strategy was also rated as highly relevant by the evaluation. The results of ES were limited to formulation of export strategy and capacity building of country partners, which is in line with the current mandate of the Function, but not yet translated into implementation in countries and there was no convincing result on the ground to demonstrate the effects on trade development and economic benefits.	Relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 4 Impact: 1
PCTP: The objective of the PCTP is to enable producers more competitive and reduce poverty, which is relevant to the organizational objectives. The ethical fashion approach applied by the programme touched upon two bottlenecks for trade development and poverty reduction: business connection with international buyers and targeting the poor. However the targeting approach of the programme is not articulated as there was a lack of poverty analysis. The evaluation considered that it is too early to conclude whether the programme has increased the social and economic benefits of the poor. However, the social impact assessment applied by the programme to measure the progress in poverty reduction holds great potential for further development and replication.	Relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 5 Impact: 4
NTF II made concrete contribution to ITC's organizational objective by effectively creating sustainable exporter competitiveness in selected export sectors in five Asian and African countries. This programme demonstrated results in enhancing the capacity of TSIs and enterprises through value chain approach, which focused on TSIs and enterprises having high potentials for expanding exports to EU and other markets. However, poverty concern (MDG) is not explicitly considered in programme design.	Relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 5 Impact: 4
EnACT aligned to the objectives of the organization through undertaking four key components: trade capacity of the countries, enterprise competitiveness (TSI), trade and market linkage, and women and youth mainstreaming in five Arabic countries: Algeria, Egypt, Jordan, Morocco and Tunisia. However, the programme objectives were generic and broad, lacking context specific considerations for formulating programme strategies. There is no strong evidence showing sustainable results in terms of trade growth.	Relevance: 4 Effectiveness: 4 Impact: 2
WEDF serves mainly as a window opportunity for ITC to build networking connections with host countries (China and Turkey) and direct discussions on topics related to ITC's work. The objectives of the WEDF were not clearly established, and the linkage between WEDF and corporate objectives was not articulated. ITC's technical divisions were not mobilized. In broad sense, WEDF may have contributed to economic development through constructing dialogues among stakeholders; however evidence is limited in terms of achieving economic development and MDG goals.	Relevance: 3 Effectiveness: 2 Impact: 1
SSCP was to promote interregional trade among Francophone countries in west Africa, Central Africa, and Vietnam, with focus on timber and NTFP products. The project objectives and activities are related to the corporate objectives of ITC in terms of economic development through trade. The total investment was USD 0.31 million for a 2 year period. Based on the evaluation, there was limited result demonstrated by the project in terms of economic development and other MDG goals.	Relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 3 Impact: 2

Expected accomplishment 1: <i>Strengthened integration of the business sector into the global economy through enhanced support to policymakers</i>		Ratings
<p>Indicators:</p> <p>(i) Increased number of export development strategies developed and implemented, including cases in which trade is integrated into national development strategies as a result of ITC support to enable decision makers to develop effective trade development programmes and policies</p> <p>(ii) Increased number of country networks having generated multilateral trading system-related activities through the support of ITC to enable decision makers to understand business needs and create an environment conducive to business;</p> <p>(iii) Increased number of cases in which country negotiating positions have been enriched through analytical input and business sector participation, with the support of ITC, to enable decision makers to integrate business dimensions into trade negotiations.</p>	<p>ES: Based on the evaluation, the ES made concrete contribution to developing national export strategies with strong participation of the country partners, and also to a less extent, to implementing the strategies, as implementation was excluded in design. The exclusion of an implementation strategy in countries compromised the relevance of promoting national export strategies to meet development objectives.</p>	<p>Relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 4 Impact: 2</p>
	<p>PCTP: Not applicable to this programme.</p>	
	<p>NTF II: Not applicable to this programme.</p>	
	<p>EnACT: The trade capacity development touched upon this objective through conducting research and training informing policy or strategy formulation. Due to the short time span, no evidence of enhanced policy making yet, except an intention to revamp the Jordan National Export Strategy.</p>	<p>Relevance: 3 Effectiveness: 3 Impact: 2</p>
	<p>WEDF contributed mainly in raising awareness of trade related development issues, which ITC was working on. The 2010 WEDF China advanced the discussion on gender mainstreaming in trade, and WEDF 2011 Turkey generated a couple of country initiatives (Uganda, Tanzania). However, the alignment to this corporate objective is marginal. Due to this fundamental shortcoming, WEDF represents a missed opportunity for ITC to promote policy dialogue on the critical trade development issues which ITC intended to play as a thought leader.</p>	<p>Relevance: 3 Effectiveness: 3 Impact: 1</p>
	<p>SSCP: Not applicable</p>	
<p>Composite rating for expected accomplishment 1:</p>		<p>Moderately unsatisfactory 2.9</p>
Expected accomplishment 2: <i>Increased capacity of trade support institutions to support businesses</i>		
<p>Indicators:</p> <p>(i) Increased number of trade support institutions having improved their ranking on the ITC trade support institutions benchmarking scheme through support provided by the Centre</p> <p>(ii) Increased number of policy proposals involving ITC support having been presented by technical support institutions to the competent authorities</p>	<p>ES: Capacity building is built-in to the ES formulation process and has been recognized by beneficiaries as a strong comparative advantage. Number of beneficiaries in strategy capacity building focused on navigator, team leaders (10-15 people). The evaluation found the strategy process was replicated in new sectors, geographical regions and at national level by participants in ITC-ES led initiatives. There is no evidence of increased trade made due to the ES capacity building.</p>	<p>Relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 4 Impact: 3</p>
	<p>PCTP: Not applicable.</p>	
	<p>NTF II was designed to strengthen the capacity of selected TSIs in serving export of enterprises along selected value chains in five developing countries. The TSIs supported by the project were able to generate revenues to sustain their business activities. The benefit in terms of TSIs' capacity largely depends on TSI's commitment and capacity.</p>	<p>Relevance: 6 Effectiveness: 5 Impact: 4</p>

	<p>EnACT worked with TSIs in Egypt and Tunisia in promoting export opportunities. The partnership with TSIs is conducive for building the capacities of the TSIs in serving enterprises. However, it was not clear whether the workshops and study services provided by the TSIs effectively increased export of enterprises.</p>	<p>Rating of relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 3 Impact: 3</p>
	<p>WEDF: Not applicable</p>	
	<p>SSCP: The project met the Viet Nam delegations and missions in 1 or 2 countries in trade and economy areas, aiming to increase trade between Viet Nam and the host countries. However there is no evidence of significant trade growth yet.</p>	<p>Relevance: 4 Effectiveness: 3 Impact: 1</p>
	<p>Composite rating for expected accomplishment 2:</p>	<p>Moderately satisfactory 3.8</p>
<p><u>Expected accomplishment 3:</u> <i>Strengthened international competitiveness of enterprises through ITC training and support</i></p>		
<p><u>Indicators:</u></p> <p>(i) Increased number of enterprises enabled to formulate sound international business strategies through ITC training on export management issues, delivered directly or indirectly</p> <p>(ii) Increased number of enterprises enabled to become export-ready through ITC training activities focusing on export readiness, delivered directly or indirectly</p> <p>(iii) Increased number of enterprises having met potential buyers and, as a result, having transacted business through ITC support</p>	<p>ES: The evaluation finds no evidence of impact on enterprise's capacity and trade growth, which although should be the outcomes of implementing export strategies.</p>	<p>Relevance: 4 Effectiveness: 2 Impact: 1</p>
	<p>PCTP made contributions to supporting the social enterprise – Ethical Fashion Africa Ltd (EFAL) in Kenya. PCTP partnered with EFAL in taking business orders from international fashion houses and the EFAL organized production by the local workers (entrepreneurs). The capacity of the social enterprise in supplying international fashion houses and organizing local production were significantly enhanced. However the sustainability of the social enterprise is depending on whether they could sustain or expand business orders on their own after the project completed, which is uncertain.</p>	<p>Relevance: 5 Effectiveness: 5 Impact: 4</p>
	<p>NTF II enhanced the SME competitiveness and export transactions. 52 % Bangladeshi beneficiaries increased exports to Europe in 2012, and enterprises in Senegal and Uganda made progress in reaching the quality standards for export. The SMEs that achieved the best results were those which were export ready. For the others, the TSIs endeavoured to establish a business-oriented exposure for the producers.</p>	<p>Relevance: 6 Effectiveness: 4 Impact: 4</p>
	<p>EnACT reported a few small-scale sales to international clients, such as an order from the Louvre Museum for Sisal products in Jordan, and sales of Tunisian Caravan Serial to Japan. However, for the time being, there is no indication that enterprises could benefit in sustainable manner with continued revenue from international orders of this nature.</p>	<p>Relevance: 4 Effectiveness: 4 Impact: 2</p>
	<p>WEDF: Not applicable</p>	
	<p>SSCP: Three timber trade contracts signed between a Vietnamese company with Congo, Cameroon and Gabon, worth EUR 4.2 million.</p>	<p>Relevance: 4 Effectiveness: 4 Impact: 2</p>
	<p>Composite rating for expected accomplishment 3:</p>	<p>Moderately satisfactory 3.7</p>